



Advance Payments of the Premium Tax Credit (APTC) and Federally-facilitated Exchange (FFE) User Fee Program Assessment Report

for

CHRISTUS Health Plan

August 17, 2022

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Sections 1401 and 1412 of the Affordable Care Act (ACA) established the advance payments of the premium tax credit (APTC) program to support the provision of affordable health care coverage to individuals. Additionally, section 1311 of the ACA allows the Federally-facilitated Exchanges (FFE) to charge participating issuers user fees to support FFE operations.

Under title 45 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR), sections §§ 156.480 and 156.705, the Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) may audit issuers that offer a Qualified Health Plan (QHP) in the individual market through an Exchange to assess the degree of compliance with the APTC and FFE user fee program requirements. The Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services (CMS) established an audit protocol to assess health insurance issuers' compliance with the following regulations governing APTC and FFE user fee programs and other related applicable Exchange operational standards:

- 45 CFR § 155.400: Enrollment of qualified individuals into QHPs;
- 45 CFR § 155.430: Termination of Exchange enrollment or coverage;
- 45 CFR § 156.50: Financial support;
- 45 CFR § 156.270: Termination of coverage or enrollment for qualified individuals;
- 45 CFR § 156.460: Reduction of enrollee's share of premium to account for advance payments of the premium tax credit;
- 45 CFR § 156.480: Oversight of the administration of the cost-sharing reductions and advance payments of the premium tax credit programs; and
- 45 CFR § 156.705: Maintenance of records for Federally-facilitated Exchanges.

This report is an assessment of CHRISTUS Health Plan (CHRISTUS)'s compliance with the APTC and FFE user fee programs. CHRISTUS is a health insurance issuer that offered QHPs in the individual market on the FFE in Texas during the 2016 benefit year. The issuer received a total of \$28,033,820.35 in APTC from CMS and paid a total of \$1,428,728.64 in FFE user fees to CMS for the 2016 benefit year. The payment amounts were calculated using CMS's automated payment system, policy-based payments (PBP).

Based on the assessment of CHRISTUS' program participation, if CMS found any instances of issuer non-compliance with APTC and FFE user fee program requirements that requires correction to payment, then CMS classified it as a *finding* in section III. If CMS found a deviation from APTC and FFE user fee program requirements that does not require correction to payment, then CMS categorized it as an *observation* in section IV in order to call management's attention to the issue(s) for purposes of improving compliance in future program years.

II. BACKGROUND AND AUDIT METHODOLOGY

A. PBP Background

Starting in 2016, CMS implemented an automated PBP system to support the collection of FFE user fees and to make monthly payments of APTC. The PBP system calculates the payment and charge amounts based on enrollment information at the policy level. CMS and issuers use the X12 standard 834 enrollment transaction in real time to exchange FFE enrollment data. To confirm the accuracy and consistency of the FFE enrollment data that CMS uses to make automated payments, CMS also conducts a monthly enrollment reconciliation process. CMS provides a Pre-Audit File to issuers containing a snapshot of the FFE database for the benefit year, and issuers respond by submitting an Inbound Reconciliation (RCNI) File to CMS that contains the benefit year's enrollment data as reflected in the issuer's systems. As a part of the reconciliation processes, CMS reconciles the RCNI file with the Pre-Audit File using a set of business rules that reflect CMS's enrollment policy to determine whether updates were required. This process implements a complex set of business rules to determine which issuer enrollment updates are accepted or rejected. The output of the comparison, the Outbound Reconciliation (RCNO) File, is sent to issuers to show which records CMS anticipates updating in the FFE database and which records CMS is directing the issuer to update in their systems. CMS conducted this enrollment reconciliation process for the 2016 benefit year from December 2015 through April 2017.

CMS provided a final opportunity for issuers to compare their 2016 FFE individual enrollment data with the current 2016 enrollment data in the FFE database, via three (3) optional off-cycle enrollment reconciliation processes in June 2020, September 2020 and October 2020. Unlike typical enrollment reconciliation runs, CMS did not update FFE enrollment data based on the off-cycle enrollment reconciliation. Instead, issuers were encouraged to submit disputes for any outstanding discrepancies resulting from the off-cycle enrollment reconciliation processes that required updates to FFE data.

B. Audit Methodology

On December 19, 2019, CHRISTUS was notified by CMS that they were selected for audit for the 2016 benefit year. Once selected, CMS required the submission of a PBP Desk Audit File that contained the 2016 benefit year individual market enrollment data as currently reflected in the issuer's systems. CMS also required the submission of policies and procedures, policy documentation for selected samples of policies, and a Premium Payment Data Extract containing premium payment data from the issuer's system for a selected sample of policies. Using the issuer provided data files and documentation, the following audit procedures were performed to assess compliance with APTC and FFE user fee program rules and regulations.

Validations of PBP Payments/Charges based on Data Reported in CMS's Systems through Enrollment Reconciliation

Using the issuer provided PBP Desk Audit File, CMS executed audit procedures to identify the policies that have a financial impact listed in section III of this report. CMS performed reviews and comparisons of the issuer's PBP Desk Audit File against the latest CMS enrollment reconciliation run data for the 2016 benefit year. CMS referred to its enrollment policy and PBP requirements to develop the audit protocols that determine whether the discrepancies identified through these reviews and comparisons required

adjustment to payment¹. Data differences between the issuer's enrollment records and the FFE data were reviewed and communicated to the issuer for resolution or confirmation as part of the audit process. Any policies with the following remaining confirmed data differences that required adjustment to payment after the completion of this process are detailed in an Excel file provided to CHRISTUS in conjunction with the draft report:

- 1) Coverage status: Policies that were effectuated in CMS's data but not the issuer's data or vice-versa (referred to as "CMS Unreconciled" or "Issuer Unreconciled", respectively);
- 2) Coverage dates: Policies where the dates of coverage did not align between CMS and the issuer (referred to as "CMS Extra Coverage" or "Issuer Extra Coverage"); and/or
- 3) Financial differences: Policies where premium and resulting FFE user fee and/or APTC amounts differed between CMS's data and the issuer's data (referred to as "Financial Differences with/without Coverage Differences").

Validations of the Correct Application of CMS Enrollment Policy

Using the policy documentation, data files, and policies and procedures provided by the issuer, CMS executed audit procedures to identify the observations listed in section IV of this report. The reviews include policy-level analysis of issuer Unaffiliated Issuer Enrollments, Issuer Update (I) and FFE Update (F) Flag Review, Fifteen (15) Subscriber Sample Policy-level Documentation Review, Premium Payment Data Extract Validations, and review of policies and procedures.

CMS conducted a discrepancy phase following execution of the audit procedures detailed above to work with the issuer to resolve or reduce data differences identified. CMS adjudicated the issuer follow-up and, after the analysis, issued this report.

¹ [Enrollment Reconciliation rules](https://www.regtap.info/) are available on <https://www.regtap.info/>

III. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS WITH FINANCIAL IMPACT

A finding is the identification of an instance of issuer non-compliance with APTC and FFE user fee program requirements that requires correction to payment. CMS's audit procedures identified data differences that resulted in a change to the total APTC payment made to CHRISTUS and the total FFE user fees collected from CHRISTUS for individual market plans during the 2016 benefit year. The APTC and FFE user fee financial impact is shown in the following table.

APTC Payment and FFE User Fee Collection Financial Impact

	Number of Policies Impacted	APTC Payment	FFE User Fee Payment	Total
Policies where CMS owes the Issuer APTC	0	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
Policies where the Issuer owes CMS APTC	643	\$(768,646.85)	\$35,851.74	\$(732,795.11)
User Fee Only Policies where CMS owes the Issuer FFE UF	13	N/A	\$537.81	\$537.81
User Fee Only Policies where the Issuer owes CMS FFE UF	68	N/A	\$(3,241.12)	\$(3,241.12)
Total Impact	724	\$(768,646.85)	\$33,148.43	\$(735,498.42)

Note: Positive values indicate funds owed to the issuer; negative values indicate amounts owed to CMS.

The net financial impact is a payment from CHRISTUS to CMS of \$735,498.42, which consists of \$768,646.85 in APTC to be returned to CMS and \$33,148.43 in FFE user fees to be returned to CHRISTUS. The policies impacted and the associated financial impact are detailed in an Excel file provided to CHRISTUS in conjunction with the draft report.

The APTC payment and user fee payment adjustments will be processed in the monthly payment cycle and netted against any other payments or charges as indicated by CMS's netting rules.²

² For more information on CMS's payment and collections processes, please visit <https://www.ecfr.gov/current/title-45/subtitle-A/subchapter-B/part-156/subpart-M/section-156.1215>.

IV. SUMMARY OF OBSERVATIONS

An observation is a deviation from APTC and FFE user fee program requirements that is called to the attention of management for purposes of improving compliance in future program years but that does not require correction to payment. While CMS is not adjusting APTC payment, we note issuer deviations from CMS's enrollment regulations or guidance where applicable. CMS's audit procedures identified the following two (2) observations:

- CHRISTUS provided coverage and reported enrollment and payment data in the PBP Desk Audit File for one (1) of the forty-five (45) policies reviewed in the Issuer Update (I) and FFE Update (F) Flag Review, one (1) of the eighty-eight (88) policies reviewed in the Premium Payment Data Extract Validations, and three (3) policies identified in the Fifteen (15) Subscriber Sample Policy-level Documentation Review who did not pay all outstanding premiums prior to the end of the three (3) month grace period. For the policies, the issuer indicated the following explanations:
 - For the policy with payments for months 8-11 received on 11/28/16, the issuer indicated, "The next payment they made was for \$421.44 on 11/28/16. This payment paid the member through 10/31/2016. Member still received coverage through months 8-11."
 - For the policy with coverage for months 5-12, the issuer indicated, "Member was paying \$215.61 when they should have been paying \$287.61 causing a rolling balance to occur. Future payments were applied to this balance causing missed payment situation."
 - For the policy with coverage for months 2-7 and late payments for months 4-6, the issuer indicated, "Member's payment of \$86.82 made on 6/14/2016 paid for 4/16 and 5/16 which made them one month late on paying for 6/16 which they made a payment for on 7/5/16. This caused them to be out of the 3-month grace period. Member received coverage to end of 7/16."
 - For the policy with coverage for months 1-12 and late payments for months 9-12, the issuer indicated, "Member was allowed to make a payment of \$76.00 which paid the member from 9/16 - 12/16. Member was receiving coverage through this period."
 - For the policy with coverage for months 1-12 and late payments for months 4-8, the issuer indicated, "Member was allowed to make a payment of \$125 to catch up their account and keep it from being terminated. The amount should have been \$129.12 for the months of 4/16 - 7/16. This caused member to have a running balance of \$3.16. Member was receiving coverage through this period."

Pursuant to 45 CFR 156.270(g), if an enrollee receiving APTC exhausts the 3-month grace period without paying all outstanding premiums, the QHP issuer must terminate the enrollee's enrollment through the Exchange on the last day of the first month of the 3-month grace period.

- CHRISTUS received the binder payment within the issuer's threshold of 95%, but not within thirty (30) calendar days from the coverage effective date, for five (5) of the forty-five (45) policies reviewed in the Issuer Update (I) and FFE Update (F) Flag Review and one (1) policy reviewed in the Fifteen (15) Subscriber Sample Policy-level Documentation Review. The issuer indicated the members continued to receive coverage but the member made a late binder payment or the member paid their binder payment "with the expectation that they would pay the full balance of that month plus the two months that followed." The issuer further indicated, "Upon review, CHRISTUS Health Plan did not identify other individuals for whom coverage was granted in 2016 despite not making the binder payment within 30 days of the coverage effective date. We believe system challenges were to blame for this issue in 2016. To rectify these system challenges and avoid further issues in the future,

CHRISTUS Health Plan implemented a new enrollment and billing vendor in Q3 of 2018.” Pursuant to 45 CFR 45 CFR § 155.400(e), for first month (or binder payment) premiums, premium payment deadlines must be no earlier than the coverage effective date, but no later than thirty (30) calendar days from the coverage effective date.

Appendix 1 – Issuer Management Response to Net Financial Adjustment

Issuer HIOS ID: 66252

Issuer Name: CHRISTUS Health Plan (CHRISTUS)

The undersigned Chief Executive Officer (CEO), Chief Financial Officer (CFO) or other authorized official who can legally and financially bind this issuer has reviewed the information included in the audit report of the issuer's 2016 benefit year APTC and FFE user fee program, resulting in a payment to CMS of \$735,498.42, consisting of \$768,646.85 in APTC to be returned to CMS and \$33,148.43 in FFE user to be returned to CHRISTUS, and:

(INITIAL) STA Agrees with the audit net adjustment amount above, confirming the audit financial impact and observation(s), if applicable, and as such this report will be considered final and published.

Or

(INITIAL) _____ Disagrees and requests a review of additional information that may impact the audit net adjustment amount resulting from the audit. As you requested a review, CMS will consider this draft only a preliminary audit report. As the review option was selected, you must provide a written explanation with any additional documentation when you return this response within thirty (30) calendar days of the date of this draft audit report. CMS will review the written explanation and any supporting documentation to determine if the report can be amended in a mutually acceptable manner. If you and CMS are unable to come to a mutually acceptable result, your response to this report will be included in the final published audit report.

Signed: 
(Signature of authorized official acting on behalf of the Issuer)

Printed Name: Steven Anderson
(Print name of signature)

Position Title: VP Chief Financial Officer
(Title of authorized official acting on behalf of the Issuer)

Direct Telephone Number: 469-282-3278

Email Address: steven.anderson@christushealth.org